

8.9 Selecting relevant and sufficient evidence

Name: _____ Class: _____ Date: _____

Total: 12 marks

Objective

Build the skills to select **evidence in a short poem** 短诗取证.

You must be able to:

- state the conditions for effectiveness and sufficiency
- explain what sufficiency means in a fourteen-line poem
- name the six purposes evidence serves
- avoid the two opposite faults

1 Worked examples

Study these first. Each one shows the method for a task used later.

■ Conditions

Effective: commentary explains a logical relationship between evidence and claim.

Sufficient: quantity and quality provide apt support for the line of reasoning.

■ In a short poem

There is little text, so sufficiency is nearly always about **quality**: the right three words, closely read, outweigh six loosely gestured at.

■ Six purposes

Illustrate, clarify, exemplify, associate, amplify, or qualify.

■ Two faults

Too little: one quotation carrying an essay's whole claim. **Too much:** quoting most of a short poem, which leaves nothing for the commentary to be about. Both fail sufficiency from opposite directions.

2 Practice

2.1 State the conditions for effectiveness and sufficiency. [2]

2.2 Explain what sufficiency usually means in a short poem. [2]

2.3 There are two opposite faults.

(a) Name them. [2]

(b) State why quoting most of a short poem fails. [1]

3 Exam-style questions

3.1 In a short poem, sufficiency is usually about [1]

- **A** quality
- **B** quantity
- **C** length
- **D** rhyme

3.2 Quoting most of a short poem leaves nothing for [1]

- **A** the commentary to be about
- **B** the thesis
- **C** the title
- **D** the reader

3.3 An essay on a fourteen-line poem quotes ten of the lines.

(a) State the fault. [1]

(b) Explain the fix.

[2]

Solutions

2.1 effective when commentary explains a logical relationship between evidence and claim; sufficient when quantity and quality aptly support the line of reasoning.

2.2 quality rather than quantity, since the right few words closely read outweigh many loosely gestured at.

2.3 (a) too little — one quotation carrying the whole claim; too much — quoting most of the poem. (b) it leaves nothing for the commentary to be about.

3.1 A. quality.

3.2 A. the commentary.

3.3 (a) too much evidence and too little commentary. (b) cut to the two or three phrases the claim actually rests on and use the space to explain what those phrases do.